

MINUTES

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
7447 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD
FIRST FLOOR COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT CONFERENCE ROOM
MAY 13, 2004
5:00 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 P.M.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Ed Wimmer, Chair
B.J. Gonzales, Vice Chair
George Hartz
Cathy Johnson
Kathy Howard

Absent: Nancy Dallett
Paul Winslow

Staff: Don Meserve
Debbie Abele, HPO

Visitors: Ken Allen, Mark Philp, Kira Wauwie, Scott Lyon

ROLL CALL

A formal roll call confirmed members present as stated above.

MINUTES

Chair Wimmer explained the Commission would defer approving the minutes until the next meeting since they did not receive the minutes in time to read them. Mr. Meserve noted that staff has distributed the draft May 5, 2004 minutes that would also be approved at the next meeting.

WORK STUDY ITEM: Hotel Valley Ho Historic Property – review background, prior approvals, and current amended plans with the owner and architects for this project in preparation for a future hearing on a Certificate of Appropriateness for the latest site plan, elevations and other elements of the project.

Ms. Abele stated that on May 5, 2004 the Commission held a special meeting to amend the Hotel Valley Ho HP Plan. She explained the purpose of this work session is to review the background, prior approvals, and current amended plans with the owner and

their architects for this project. The work session is in preparation for a future hearing on a Certificate of Appropriateness for the latest site plan, elevations and other elements of the Hotel Valley Ho project. She further explained that some items are not finalized. She remarked they would walk through the pending certificate of appropriateness application tonight and describe what has changed in the project since the October 2002 approval.

Ken Allen, Allen + Philp Architects reviewed each of the changes since the original approval noting that a lot has transpired since October 2002 and the plans have gone through many iterations. He discussed the site plan and unique features on the property. He reported that they received approval from the Planning Commission for the height amendment to the tower and hopes to receive City Council approval on May 17th. He described how they have reorganized the site. He reported they have preliminary designs for the landscaping and parking locations. He further reported that all of the parking for the entire site has been calculated, including Phase II, so they would not have to come back for modifications. He provided information on what elements would need to come back for Commission approval, including elevations for the Phase II Traders Vic's restaurant and the ballroom that are not part of the current application.

Commissioner Gonzales noted that there is a stipulation in the HP Plan design guidelines regarding how the new buildings react to the original buildings. Mr. Philp reported that there has been a lot of discussion regarding how to connect the new to the old and the intent is that they would work together. He further noted they have successfully been able to pull that off.

Mr. Philp explained that they made the decision that the pool shape is important and a character-defining feature but, due to Health Department issues, they have to rebuild it in its current location. He provided information on the landscape palette that would be used on this project. He reviewed the materials that would be used throughout this project.

Commissioner Gonzales inquired if there was mechanical equipment on top of the northern tower. Mr. Philp replied that tower is for elevator access.

Commissioner Johnson inquired about the highest point of the building. Mr. Allen replied the elevator tower would be 86 feet and the height of the stairs would be 89 feet, based on the exceptions to the maximum 72' building height in the ordinance for stair towers and elevators.

Chair Wimmer inquired about the light patterned element on the south elevation of the stair entry feature. Mr. Philp explained that when they peeled off the stucco on the south face of the tower they found a wonderful masonry grid block behind it, and turned that design element in the new portion of the tower into a bronze like metal surface that has illumination between the panels noting that it became like a piece of art.

Mr. Allen reported that they hope to start construction in June.

Chair Wimmer congratulated the architects' on getting through the process. Mr. Allen reported that staff, this Commission, and the Fire Department have all worked together and put in a lot of time and effort on reviewing this project.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Historic Register Committee

Commissioner Howard stated the Historic Register Committee did not meet on May 12th because Mr. Meserve and Ms. Abele were involved in the Planning Commission hearing on the Valley Ho height amendment so they rescheduled the next meeting for June 9th. She further stated the neighborhood survey results are due on June 2nd and will be evaluated and compiled by staff in time for the June 9th meeting.

She reported the group discussed the possibility of committee members doing research on multi-family housing. It was suggested that they invite Commissioner Dallett to the June 9th meeting since she has experience in this area.

Education Outreach Committee

Commissioner Hartz reported the Education Outreach Committee has been making significant progress on a couple of items. He further reported the committee discussed the idea of looking into whether they could use the Mayor's Breakfast as an alternative to the community forum. They have approached the city and have received a positive response. They felt they would use the Mayor's breakfast as a kickoff for the neighborhood preservation effort. He noted that they are working on a series of brochures focusing on the properties that have been designated. He further noted the timing would be to have the fliers and neighborhood fliers ready for the Mayor's breakfast and other neighborhood meetings.

Chair Wimmer inquired if the committee has discussed improving the website. Commissioner Hartz replied the committee has discussed trying to find ways to make their website more user friendly and will be having more discussions on this topic.

PRESENTATION: SCOTTSDALE'S POSTWAR SCHOOL POPULATION

Ms. Abele introduced one of her student's, Vicki Bendau, explaining that she did an independent study, as part of her masters program, on postwar buildings in the Scottsdale Unified School District. Ms. Bendau selected Arcadia High School as a class project and started assisting the School Board and Planning Committee because the fate of that building was in question. Out of this paper came a larger paper that Ms. Bendau will be discussing tonight.

Ms. Bendau did a slide presentation on her survey results on the Scottsdale Unified School District postwar building survey. She presented information on the bond issue to rebuild high schools and how it might impact the older high school campuses.

Commissioner Hartz inquired if there was anything the Commission could do because Arcadia High School is not in Scottsdale. Ms. Abele replied they could only be concerned about buildings in other jurisdictions.

Ms. Bendau stated one of the obstacles is the political will of the District and administration. They appear to be of the mind set that these buildings should be knocked down and built new. Her data suggests it would be cheaper for the District to rehabilitate older buildings than to rebuild the campuses. She reviewed the six steps toward a proactive school preservation policy:

1. Identify stakeholders and resources. Engage joint city/school collaboration; partner with Scottsdale and Phoenix HP officers.
2. Begin with the district Facilities Master Plan. Survey the schools recommended for “full modernization” first. They are the oldest, and most likely to be considered historic or architecturally significant.
3. Establish historic context through scholarly research and analysis of architecture and historic circumstances associated with properties. To maintain the value of designation, and to focus resources, only the most important schools should be designated historic.
4. Involve students in researching their school’s history.
5. Conduct feasibility studies to compare the costs of new construction versus rehabilitation. Use school preservation experts. Make these studies available for public scrutiny and input.
6. Commit to preservation as a priority, not as an afterthought.

Commissioner Howard inquired about the number of schools Ms. Bendau studied. Ms. Bendau replied around 20 schools.

Chair Wimmer inquired how many of the schools Ms. Bendau studied were originally designed without air conditioning. Ms. Bendau replied that she did not know because the study was not that in-depth.

Ms. Abele remarked that one of the challenges is that many of these schools were poorly built because of the rush to put up schools and they were not required to get building permits. Some legitimate upgrades need to happen because they don’t want kids in unsafe buildings so they need to be selective and preserve the most significant buildings.

Commissioner Gonzales explained that some of these schools were designed with an open-air concept and with football fields and green spaces combined with the irrigation created cooling islands.

Ms. Abele explained that Ms. Bendau’s intention is to prepare a policy paper to make the School Board aware of preservation.

DISCUSSION: REATA PASS AREA PROPERTIES

Ms. Abele inquired if the Commission had any comments on the April 29th tour of Reata Pass area properties. She explained the next step would be to identify the characteristics common to western theme properties. She inquired how the Commission wanted to proceed and whether they wanted to continue researching and learning about these western theme properties.

The consensus of the Commission was to move forward and requested staff to provide them with recommendations regarding the timetable and methodology. Ms. Abele replied staff would have that information prepared for the June meeting.

HPO/STAFF REPORT AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Mr. Meserve passed out a copy of the positive editorial that was in the Republic regarding the Valley Ho and reported on the May 12th approval by the Planning Commission to add an extra story to the Hotel Valley Ho complex's central tower. He reported this item would go before the City Council for action on May 17th.

He passed out copy of the latest Scottsdale Historic Register list including the Pink Pony and Sugar Bowl, and noted that these additional properties will be added to the City web pages next week.

Mr. Meserve advised the Commission that Ms. Abele is looking the plans for the intersection of Cattle Track and McDonald for a possible Certificate of Appropriateness and at the impact of the City capital improvement project on the Cattle Track Complex zoned HP. Ms. Abele stated this issue would be brought back to a work session to give the Commission the opportunity to understand how staff makes a decision on whether to sign a Certificate of No Effect or bring a project to the Commission for consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Commissioner Gonzales requested the latest information on the Cattle Track properties and efforts to move two houses. Ms. Abele provided an update on the progress. The biggest concern is regarding how much of the adobe building can be moved without being damaged during the move.

COMMISSION COMMENTS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Commissioner Johnson reported she attended the May 11th breakfast with the Artist, which was an open public meeting to help brainstorm preliminary concepts for public art in the Old Town District. The primary location proposed for public art is the southwest corner of Brown Avenue and 1st Street. Elements will also occur on 2nd Street, to conceptually link with that of the Brown and 1st Street. She further reported that last year the Commission sent a letter to the city staff that they should take preservation into consideration in the Old Town area in the design of the parking garage. She stated that

she felt the Commission should have a presentation on this public art project so they will know what is going on, since it is in the downtown and how it would impact the appropriateness of the HP designated properties. Ms. Abele replied staff would arrange for a presentation.

FUTURE MEETINGS AND AGENDA ITEMS

Ms. Abele stated the Commission had planned on a special meeting Thursday, May 27th to review the Hotel Valley Ho. The next regular meeting will be June 10th.

Meeting adjourned at 7:00 p.m.

Submitted by:

For the Record Court Reporters